

This file contains multiple, linked worksheets to derive and compare planning level cost estimates for the draft Countywide Water Quality Monitoring Plan (CWQMP, Brown and Caldwell, Feb '06, revised May '06) and the Draft NPDES MS4 Stormwater Permit (Ecology, 2/15/06). These estimates are subject to the assumptions and factors listed.

The "Pierce Co" sheet summarizes and compares costs of the two programs.

The "Pierce Co details" sheet contains labor effort estimates for the CWQMP LTT and TD monitoring.

The "MS4 summary" sheet summarizes cost estimates developed in the two other sheets "outfalls" and "BMP Effectiveness" which contain itemized costs for each of these 2 respective MS4 monitoring requirements.

There are two levels of CWQMP cost estimates: one for the 9 LTT stations and another for the 25 LTT station option.

There are two levels of MS4 BMP Effectiveness monitoring: one for the required 35 sample sets, and another for 20 samples, a likely practical limitation given the apparent 2 year sampling period dictated by permit submittal schedule for the QAPP and the final report.

Labor costs can be changed to examine alternative scenarios and the spreadsheets will re-calculate; values of \$50/hr are assumed for the CWQMP and \$80/hr for the MS4 permit work.

Other variables are also included in the calculations and can be changed, including QC sample rate (assumed 20%), labor hours per sampling event, false start and failure rates, equipment costs, etc.

Developed by Brown and Caldwell, March 2006, revised May 2006 (revisions in green shading) to:

- 1) increase field labor needs for B-IBI and physical channel monitoring under the LTT program
- 2) add lab costs for B-IBI sample analysis (\$110 per sample, totaling \$330 for 3 replicates at each site)
- 3) increase MS4 permit outfall sampling costs for sediment parameters due to Fact Sheet pg 51 Table.

**Annual Costs for Pierce County Monitoring Program Options**  
*non-recurring costs preceded by "NR"*  
 Labor rates can be varied below and for itemized costs on linked "labor detail" worksheet  
**REVISED 5/18/06**

Draft CWQMP (2/14/06)	Costs per Program Element			basis/comment
	LTT (single station)	TD (station pairs)	totals	
# stations	9	4		
labor rate	\$ 50	\$ 50		vary labor rate as needed, \$50 assumes County FTE rate
B-IBI	\$ 10,000	\$ -	\$ 10,000	1 visit per year, 2 sites per day+ann data synth
channel	\$ 12,600	\$ 5,600	\$ 18,200	1 visit per year, 1 site per day+ann data synth
in situ bioassays	\$ 18,000	\$ 11,000	\$ 29,000	2 visits per year, 5hrs per site+data synth
continuous mon	\$ -	\$ 44,000	\$ 44,000	15 visits/year, 4 hrs per site +monthly data synth
reporting	\$ 10,000	\$ 15,000		annual reports
NR cont mon eqpt	\$ -	\$ 48,000	\$ 48,000	eqpt: \$4K purchase, \$2K installed per location (doubled for Tier 2 pair)
NR bioassay eqpt	\$ 1,000	\$ 1,000	\$ 2,000	may have to replace eqpt periodically, but is low cost
NR bioassay validation	\$ 75,000	\$ -	\$ 75,000	one time effort, consultant supported; \$50K validation+ \$25K training
first year	\$ 126,600	\$ 124,600	\$ 251,200	
successive years	\$ 50,600	\$ 75,600	\$ 126,200	
annual hrs per FTE	510	760	1,270	
5 year cost	\$ 329,000	\$ 427,000	\$ 756,000	0.64 FTE, for 2 FTEs over 5 years
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>\$</b>	<b>756,000</b>		

These estimates for CWQMP  
 1) do not include EDMS, travel costs, inflation  
 2) assumes all field work using teams of 2 personnel

Increase CWQMP	Costs per Program Element			basis/comment
	LTT (single station)	TD (station pairs)	totals	
# stations	25	4		
labor rate	\$ 50	\$ 50		alternate to cover 25 stations in Tier 1
B-IBI	\$ 26,000	\$ -	\$ 26,000	vary labor rate as needed, \$50 assumes County FTE rate
channel	\$ 35,000	\$ 5,600	\$ 40,600	1 visit per year, 2 sites per day+ann data synth
in situ bioassays	\$ 50,000	\$ 11,000	\$ 61,000	1 visit per year, 1 site per day+ann data synth
continuous mon	\$ -	\$ 44,000	\$ 44,000	2 visits per year, 5hrs per site+data synth
reporting	\$ 10,000	\$ 15,000		15 visits/year, 4 hrs per site +monthly data synth
NR cont mon eqpt	\$ -	\$ 48,000	\$ 48,000	annual reports
NR bioassay eqpt	\$ 3,000	\$ 1,000	\$ 4,000	eqpt: \$4K purchase, \$2K installed per location (doubled for pair)
NR bioassay validation	\$ 75,000	\$ -	\$ 75,000	may have to replace eqpt periodically, but is low cost
first year	\$ 199,000	\$ 124,600	\$ 323,600	one time effort, consultant supported; \$50K validation+ \$25K training
successive years	\$ 121,000	\$ 75,600	\$ 196,600	
annual hrs per FTE	1,210	760	1,970	
5 year cost	\$ 683,000	\$ 427,000	\$ 1,110,000	0.99 FTE, for 2 FTEs over 5 years
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>\$</b>	<b>1,110,000</b>		

this option same as above except uses 25 Tier 1 stations

Draft MS4 permit, 2/15/06		Outfalls (S8.A)	BMPs (S8.C)	BMPs (S8.C)	Comment/assumption
scenario	min # stations	minimum reqmt	max practical	minimum reqmt	
min # events	15		8	8	
QC rate	20%		20%	35	min # events as inferred in permit
costs below are	annual costs	total program costs		20%	high QC for organics, clean metals & overall complexity, at least in first year
analytical	\$ 81,000	\$	99,000	\$	current ARI lab rates, \$600/sample assumed for specific pest/herbicides
analytical QC	\$ 33,000	\$	40,000	\$	QC blanks & dups at same cost per sample
labor	\$ 75,000	\$	431,000	\$	using consultants at \$80/hr, with 1 false start and 1 failure per quarter
sediments	\$ 24,000		in above		3 sed samples/year, 3 days/sample for 2 consultants at 3 outfalls
acute WET	\$ 2,000		na		assumes WET labor concurrent with other sampling, but takes planning
flow control BMP	na	\$	67,000	\$	separate equipment, labor and reporting
reporting	\$ 40,000	\$	32,000	\$	1 annual report per year
MR equipment	\$ 30,000	\$	80,000	\$	\$10K per auto sampling station (sampler, flowmeter, housing), installed
MR QAPP	\$ 40,000	\$	40,000	\$	one time cost, approval required, assume one QAPP per program element
first year	\$ 325,000	\$	454,500	\$	669,000
successive year(s)	\$ 255,000	\$	334,500	\$	549,000
5 year cost	\$ 1,345,000	\$	789,000	\$	1,218,000
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>\$ 2,140,000</b>	<b>max practical (i.e. 20 pairs of BMP effectiveness samples)</b>	<b>\$ 2,570,000</b>	<b>implied minimum (i.e. 35 pairs of BMP effectiveness samples)</b>	

Other assumptions for MS4 permit estimate:

1. BMP effectiveness: assume 2 year sampling program given permit schedule dictates
2. False starts (insuff rainfall/duration) and sampling failures (eqpt/human error) assumed to expend 1/2 of the labor needed for a successful event (3 days for team of 2)
3. For simplicity, sampling labor assumes same effort per event for outfall and BMP sampling: 3 days for team of 2, which includes storm tracking, mobilization, demobilization, etc. Assumes 3 outfalls and 4 BMPs (station pairs) to sample per event.
4. Assumes consultants used due to 24-7 availability needed to meet requirements
5. No other costs included for acute WET because permit does not specify acceptance (min survival) criteria, consequences or follow up (TIE) for toxic result, or if tests based on grab or composite (time or flow)
6. For QAPPs, requirement of "one per BMP" as permit states is probably unnecessary and a single QAPP should suffice for each program element (outfalls and BMPs).
7. minimum # sampling events as inferred in permit, but likely max of 20 would be practical limit for BMP effectiveness given apparent 2 year duration.

**Cost estimate for typical TMDL study  
for fecal coliforms  
using the MST approach**

<b>Scope assumptions</b>	<b>value</b>	<b>comment</b>
study duration, yrs	1	
number of streams/subbasin	1	
number stations per stream/subbasin	6	
number stormflow sampling events per year	12	
number baseflow sampling events per year	6	
total # samples	108	
labor, man hours per sampling event (team of 2)	16	same for storm and baseflow events, assumes 1 8-hr day for team of 2 to sample 6 sites
labor rate	\$50	\$90 County labor assumed \$50/hr, consultant labor assumed \$80/hr
goal for # MST isolates	800	
cost per isolate	\$75	isolates (ribotyping) IEH laboratory (Mansour Samadpour)
E. coli test, cost per 3 replicates	\$75	need 3 replicates per sample to yield sufficient # of non-confluent colonies
ancillary parameters, cost per sample	\$325	total lab cost of \$400/sample including E. coli, and excluding MST isolates
hours for draft report	300	includes data review, validation and synthesis
hours for final report	100	one round of review and edits

<b>Item</b>	<b>Cost</b>		<b>comment</b>
	<b>using County labor</b>	<b>using consultant labor</b>	
QAPP	\$ 40,000	\$ 40,000	QAPP by consultant
supplies	\$ 5,000	\$ 5,000	
total sampling labor	\$ 14,400	\$ 25,920	
total MST	\$ 60,000	\$ 60,000	
total analytical	\$ 43,200	\$ 43,200	
draft report	\$ 15,000	\$ 27,000	
final report	\$ 5,000	\$ 9,000	
PM	\$ 18,260	\$ 21,012	10% PM rate
<b>total</b>	<b>\$ 201,000</b>	<b>\$ 232,000</b>	rounded up to nearest \$1K
scale up options	\$ 233,000	\$ 263,000	for 10 stations, 1 stream
	\$ 249,000	\$ 279,000	for 6 stations 2 streams
	\$ 312,000	\$ 343,000	for 10 stations 2 streams

**Labor Cost Summary of Feb 06 Draft CWQMP Long Term Trend (LTT) and Targeted Development (TD) Approaches**  
*[labor rate and other effort factors can be varied and summaries will re-calculate]*

Labor costs and hours per station per year using County labor at assumed rate

<b>LTT (single stations)</b>		<b>effort factors</b>					<b>comment</b>
<b>item</b>	<b>cost</b>	<b>hrs/yr</b>	<b>hrs/event</b>	<b>events/yr</b>	<b># FTEs</b>	<b>rate</b>	
BIB sampling	\$ 400	8	4.0	1	2	\$ 50	doubled labor to 4 hrs/site (2 sites/day vs 4 sites/day)
BIB data analysis	\$ 300	6	6.0	1	1	\$ 50	annual data synthesis (not reporting)
BIB sample analysis (3 reps)	\$ 330	7	6.6	1	1	\$ 50	Aquatic Biology Assoc, \$110/sample rep, for 3 reps=\$330
phys channel	\$ 800	16	8.0	1	2	\$ 50	doubled labor to 8 hrs/site (1 site/day vs 2 sites/day)
phys channel data analysis	\$ 600	12	12.0	1	1	\$ 50	annual data synthesis (not reporting)
in situ bioassay labor	\$ 1,000	20	5.0	2	2	\$ 50	2 visits per year, 5hrs per site for team of 2 FTEs
in situ bioassay data analysis	\$ 1,000	20	10.0	2	1	\$ 50	lab dupe, data capture, data synthesis
<b>total per station per year</b>	<b>\$ 4,430</b>	<b>89</b>					
note, in this portion:							
1) in-situ bioassay method validation/training not included							
2) equipment costs not included							
<b>TD (station pairs)</b>		<b>effort factors</b>					<b>comment</b>
<b>item</b>	<b>cost</b>	<b>hrs/yr</b>	<b>hrs/event</b>	<b>events/yr</b>	<b># FTEs</b>	<b>rate</b>	
continuous mon labor	\$ 6,000	120	4.0	15	2	\$ 50	weekly visit first month, then monthly: 4 hrs/station pair for 2 FTEs
continuous mon data analysis	\$ 4,800	96	8.0	12	1	\$ 50	monthly data synthesis and summary: 1 day effort per station pair
phys channel	\$ 800	16	8.0	1	2	\$ 50	doubled labor to 8 hrs/site (1 site/day vs 2 sites/day)
phys channel data analysis	\$ 600	12	12.0	1	1	\$ 50	annual data synthesis (not reporting)
in situ bioassay labor	\$ 1,600	32	8.0	2	2	\$ 50	2 visits per year, 8hrs per station pair for team of 2 FTEs
in situ bioassay data analysis	\$ 1,000	20	10.0	2	1	\$ 50	lab dupe, data capture, data synthesis
<b>total per station pair per year</b>	<b>\$ 14,800</b>	<b>296</b>					

**Cost Estimate Summary for Counties to meet MS4 Stormwater Monitoring Requirements (based on 2/15/06 draft permit)**  
*assumes independent option selected, also, Ports have different scope*  
 revised 5/18/06 to include cost of sediment analysis per Fact Sheet pg 51 Table

Program Element		analytical	labor cost	labor hrs	eqpt	Cost Element			QAPP	Annual Report	Final Report	total
						sediments	WET					
S8.A	Outfall monitoring	\$ 565,000	\$ 365,000	4,563	\$ 30,000	\$ 120,000	\$ 8,000	\$ 40,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 1,328,000		
	per year	\$ 113,000	\$ 73,000	913		\$ 24,000	\$ 1,500		\$ 40,000	\$ 252,000		
	program duration, yrs			5								
	per outfall per year	\$ 38,000	\$ 25,000	304		\$ 8,000	\$ 500		\$ 13,333	\$ 85,000		

not including eqpt  
not including QAPP

Program Element		analytical	labor cost	labor hrs	eqpt	Cost Element			QAPP	Annual Report	Final Report	total
						flow control	QAPP					
S8.C	BMP Effectiveness	\$ 99,000	\$ 431,000	5,388	\$ 80,000	\$ 67,000	\$ 40,000	\$ 16,000	\$ 16,000	\$ 749,000		
	per event	\$ 4,950	\$ 21,550	135								
	year 1	\$ 49,500	\$ 215,500	2,694	\$ 80,000	\$ 33,500	\$ 40,000	\$ 8,000	\$ 16,000	\$ 430,000		
	year 2	\$ 49,500	\$ 215,500	2,694		\$ 33,500			\$ 16,000	\$ 320,000		
	# events	20										
	# sites	4										
	program duration, yrs	2										

Program Element		not included										
S8.B Program Effectiveness												





elements compared side by side, crosshatched where absent in one or the other draft version  
significant changes shaded gray

**Draft 1 (5/16/05) elements/significant language**

S66	begin section	S6C	begin section	param cost source
	"comprehensive, long term"		"full scale field monitoring"	
	characterize treatment BMPs		evaluate O&M terms	
	characterize Flow Reduction Strategies			
1	2 questions to be addressed			
	individual option			
	collaborative option			
	22 sites per (treatment) BMP	S8D.1		
	5 flow reduction strategies (overall among permittees)	S8D.1		
	6 flow reduction strategies (overall among permittees)	2		
	use QAPP for each BMP and Q strategy	S8C.3		
	use qualified staff or contractor	S8C.3		
a.1	TAPE protocol for short del times			
	test all BMPs listed (12)			
	all permittees			
	design criteria "similar to" manual			
(1)	Basic (5 public domain)			
(2)	Enhanced (5 public domain)			
(3)	Oil (lin sand filter, CBI)			
ii.	prioritized list			
iii.	one Q strategy per City & County permittee (not Port)	S8.C.3		
iv.	provide staff assistance			
b.	no rights for "other special permittees"			
2	Program Dev. review and approval in 42 years	S8.E.1/2		
	QAPP review by ECY	S8.D.2		
	QAPPs, freq defined by permittee's QAPP			
	Flow (rate, dur, vol)			
	event: wx into			
TSS	all			
PSD	all			
pH	all			
hard	all			
temperature	all			
TPH-DX & Gx	all			
silken	all			
TR and diss Cu, Zn	all			
TR and diss As, Cd, all	all			
BNAs	all			
pesticides	all			
TN	all			
TP	all			
NOX	all			
Ortho-P	all			
BOD	all			
E. Coli	all			
Enterococcus	all			
Toxicity	all			
sediment sampling				
sediment testing				
1.	"framework for Ph II permittees"			
k.	adopted in 430 months			
l.	implemented in 436 months			
3	annual monitoring report by end of year, begin 2009	S8.E.1 and S8.F.C		



**Cost Estimate for 2/15/06 Draft MS4 Permit Stormwater Monitoring for Treatment BMP Effectiveness (\$8.0C)**

**Scope Narrative, per permittee**

- 4 BMP installations with a pair of auto samplers and flowmeters at each BMP inlet and outlet-8 monitoring stations.
- 1 flow control BMP (paired inlet/outlet continuous flow monitoring)
- full QAPP+TAPE for each BMP (thus, 2 QAPPs, but that is not necessary, so assume single QAPP)
- Implement by end of year 2, sample -2 years, submit final report by end of year 4
- assume min 20 events (up to 35 in ~ 2 years is unlikely achievable)
- false starts (good samples, bad events) and system failures (bad samples, good events) will be significant
- sediment samples of accumulated sediment in each BMP-permit text vague, assume bulk samples collected at 1/2 the stormwater sampling frequency, assume labor incidental to stormwater sampling

**Cost Estimate Factors & Assumptions**

# events 20 full analytical & labor, completed in 2 years  
 # false starts 8 1 per qtr; no analytical spent, but use 50% of event labor  
 # failures 8 1 per qtr; no analytical spent, but use 50% of event labor  
 QC rate 20% field eqpt blanks and dupes for all params  
 labor rate \$80 consultant supported  
 labor hrs per event per BMP sampling station pair 48 3 days for team of 2 (6 man days)  
 labor hrs per annual report per BMP family 50 (100 hours for program per year for 2 years)  
 labor hrs per final report per BMP family 100 (200 hours total for final report)  
 flow control labor 480 total hours over 2 years (12 man weeks) for single site for flow monitoring, data synthesis and evaluation

BMP family	cost/event/BMP			other costs			total recurring costs per BMP				reporting		total	
	analytical	labor	total	false start	failure	QC analyt	analyt	labor	settlements	total	eqpt	ann report		final report
BASIC	\$ 850	\$ 3,840	\$ 5,540	\$ 1,920	\$ 1,920	\$ 3,400	\$ 20,400	\$ 107,520	\$ 4,300	\$ 132,220	\$ 20,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 8,000	\$ 320,440
ENH	\$ 850	\$ 3,840	\$ 5,540	\$ 1,920	\$ 1,920	\$ 3,400	\$ 20,400	\$ 107,520	\$ 4,300	\$ 132,220	\$ 20,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 8,000	\$ 320,440
Oil control	\$ 540	\$ 3,840	\$ 4,920	\$ 1,920	\$ 1,920	\$ 2,160	\$ 12,960	\$ 107,520	\$ 4,300	\$ 124,780	\$ 13,000	\$ 4,000	\$ 8,000	\$ 291,560
Subtotal for testing 2 installations of 2 BMPs (Basic+Enh)							\$ 98,800	\$ 430,080			\$ 80,000	\$ 16,000	\$ 16,000	\$ 640,880

Flow Control			\$ 38,400			\$ 12,000			\$ 4,000		\$ 8,000		\$ 66,400
--------------	--	--	-----------	--	--	-----------	--	--	----------	--	----------	--	-----------

pick 2 of these 3 BMP families for program for total cost using consultants \$ 707,280

above at staff cost of \$50/hr \$ 513,600

total	5,856	per person	2,928
field labor hours in above	732	includes flow control labor	
field labor days in above	37		
field labor months in above	18		
total reporting labor hours in above	400	\$ 32,000	
total annual report hours (2 annual reports)	200		
total final report hours	200		

this portion of the cost estimate does not include QAPP development  
 does not include mileage, supplies and other ODC

Sediment Monitoring Portion	# samples	cost	source	method
assume labor covered in stormwater sampling labor above	10			
assume 50% of water sampling burden				
analyt				
% solids	10 ARI			
grain size	95 ARI			
TVS	25 ARI			
TPHDX	65 ARI			
Cd	35 ARI			
Cu	35 ARI			
Pb	35 ARI			
Zn	30 ARI			
P	35 ARI			
digestion	20 ARI			
TOC	45 ARI			
total	\$ 430			

Item	Type	approximate eqpt costs	comment
Sampler	ISCO	\$ 4,000	
flowmeter	area velocity	\$ 4,000	needed for round pipes
flowmeter	brubaker/dulcifer	\$ 3,000	for open channels/weirs/flumes
hourly/supplies	installation labor	\$ 2,000	plastic garden shield or steel utility box
telemetry option		\$ 8,000	DEM system, cell phone uplink